

ISSN 2332-3205

Volume 11 Number 10 2023



# *Universal Journal of Education Research*

*<http://www.hrpub.org>*

**Horizon Research Publishing, USA**



---

## Universal Journal of Educational Research

Universal Journal of Educational Research is an international peer-reviewed journal that publishes original and high-quality research papers in all areas of education. As an important academic exchange platform, scientists and researchers can know the most up-to-date academic trends and seek valuable primary sources for reference. The subject areas include, but are not limited to the following fields: Educational Philosophy and Theory, Educational Policy, Pedagogy, Educational Administration and Educational Management, Curriculum Studies, Discipline-based Education, International Education, Teacher Education, Distance Education, Professional & Vocational Education, Adult Education, Educational Psychology, Educational Technology, Elementary Education, Higher Education, Language Education, Education and Training, Testing and Evaluation, Secondary Education, Special Education, Childhood Education.

### General Inquires

Publish with HRPUB, learn about our policies, submission guidelines etc.

Email: [editor@hrpub.org](mailto:editor@hrpub.org)

Tel: +1-626-626-7940

### Subscriptions (Electronic Version Only)

**Journal Title:** Universal Journal of Educational Research

**Journal's Homepage:** [http://www.hrpub.org/journals/jour\\_info.php?id=95](http://www.hrpub.org/journals/jour_info.php?id=95)

**Publisher:** Horizon Research Publishing Co.,Ltd

**Publication Frequency:** monthly

**Electronic Version:** freely online available at [http://www.hrpub.org/journals/jour\\_info.php?id=95](http://www.hrpub.org/journals/jour_info.php?id=95)

### Online Submission

Manuscripts should be submitted by Online Manuscript Tracking System (<http://www.hrpub.org/submission.php>).

If you are experiencing difficulties during the submission process, please feel free to contact the editor at [submission@hrpub.org](mailto:submission@hrpub.org).

### Copyright

Authors retains all copyright interest or it is retained by other copyright holder, as appropriate and agrees that the manuscript remains permanently open access in HRPUB 's site under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution International License (CC BY). HRPUB shall have the right to use and archive the content for the purpose of creating a record and may reformat or paraphrase to benefit the display of the record.

### Creative Commons Attribution License (CC-BY)

All articles published by HRPUB will be distributed under the terms and conditions of the Creative Commons Attribution License(CC-BY). So anyone is allowed to copy, distribute, and transmit the article on condition that the original article and source is correctly cited.

### Open Access

Open access is the practice of providing unrestricted access to peer-reviewed academic journal articles via the internet. It is also increasingly being provided to scholarly monographs and book chapters. All original research papers published by HRPUB are available freely and permanently accessible online immediately after publication. Readers are free to copy and distribute the contribution under creative commons attribution-non commercial licence. Authors can benefit from the open access publication model a lot from the following aspects:

- High Availability and High Visibility-free and unlimited accessibility of the publication over the internet without any restrictions;
- Rigorous peer review of research papers----Fast, high-quality double blind peer review;
- Faster publication with less cost----Papers published on the internet without any subscription charge;
- Higher Citation----open access publications are more frequently cited.

# Universal Journal of Education Research

---

## Editor-in-Chief

Sara Nosari University of Turin, Italy

## Honorary Editor-in-Chief

Dr. Lynn. J. McNair University of Edinburgh, UK

## Deputy Editor-in-Chief

Dr. Serafina Manuela Pastore University of Bari Aldo Moro, Italy  
Dr. Susana Adelina Moreira Carvalho Higher Education Institute of Accounting and Administration, Coimbra, Portugal  
Dr. Vincenzo A. Piccione Roma Tre University, Italy  
Dr. Mehmet Basaran Gaziantep University, Turkey  
Dr. Michail Kalogiannakis University of Crete, Greece

## Members of Editorial Board

Prof. Osman Cekic Canakkale Onsekiz Mart University, Turkey  
Prof. Einar M. Skaalvik Norwegian University of Science and Technology, Norway  
Prof. Fatma Nevra Seggie Bogazici University, Turkey  
Prof. Jose Hernandez-Carrion University of Valencia, Spain  
Prof. Maria Veiga-Branco Polytechnic Institute of Brqganco, Portugal  
Prof. Joana Fernandes Polytechnic Institute of Bragança, Portugal  
Prof. Chhavi Lal Dayalbagh Educational Institute, India  
Prof. Marina De Rossi University of Padua, Italy  
Prof. Kathy Peckham-hardin California State University, USA  
Prof. Amalia Venera Todorut Constantin Brâncuși University, Romania  
Prof. Claudio Longobardi University of Turin, Italy  
Dr. Janaina Minelli De Oliveira Rovira i Virgili University, Spain  
Dr. Francisco Javier Ramos University of Castilla-La Mancha, Spain  
Dr. Rebeca Soler Costa University of Zaragoza, Spain  
Dr. Darren Pullen University of Tasmania, Australia  
Dr. Laura Clarke Ball State University, USA  
Dr. Sister Corby A Coperthwaite Connecticut State Colleges and Universities, USA  
Dr. Elena Makarova Taganrog Institute of Management and Economics, Russia  
Dr. Monika Floyd University of Potsdam, Germany  
Dr. David Newlyn University of Western Sydney, Australia  
Dr. Elzbieta Gajek University of Warsaw, Poland  
Dr. Bradley Young Zayed University, United Arab Emirates  
Dr. Megha Uplane University of Pune, India  
Dr. Mingchu (Neal) Luo The Teachers College, Emporia State University, USA  
Dr. Sorina CHIRCU Politehnica University of Bucharest, Romania

ISSN 2332-3205

# Table of Contents

## Universal Journal of Educational Research

Volume 11 Number 10 2023

### **The 4Cs as a Process and a Product in Doctoral Education**

*(<https://www.doi.org/10.13189/ujer.2023.111001>)*

Isabel Ribau .....173

### **Trends of Studies Conducted on the Flipped Learning: A Systematic Literature Review**

*(<https://www.doi.org/10.13189/ujer.2023.111002>)*

Özgül Gültekin Talayhan, Mehmet Veysi Babayigit .....184



# Universal Journal of Education Research

## Call for Papers

Universal Journal of Educational Research is an international peer-reviewed journal that publishes original and high-quality research papers in all areas of education. As an important academic exchange platform, scientists and researchers can know the most up-to-date academic trends and seek valuable primary sources for reference.

### Aims & Scope

- Educational Philosophy and Theory
- Educational Policy
- Pedagogy
- Educational Administration and Educational Management
- Curriculum Studies
- Discipline-based Education
- International Education
- Teacher Education
- Distance Education
- Professional & Vocational Education
- Adult Education
- Educational Psychology
- Educational Technology
- Elementary Education
- Higher Education
- Language Education
- Education and Training
- Testing and Evaluation
- Secondary Education
- Special Education
- Childhood Education

### Editorial Board

Prof. Sara Nosari	University of Turin, Italy
Dr. Lynn. J. McNair	University of Edinburgh, UK
Dr. Serafina Manuela Pastore	University of Bari Aldo Moro, Italy
Dr. Susana Adelina Moreira Carvalho Bastos	Higher Education Institute of Accounting and Administration, Portugal
Dr. Vincenzo A. Piccione	Roma Tre University, Italy
Dr. Mehmet Basaran	Gaziantep University, Turkey
Dr. Michail Kalogiannakis	University of Crete, Greece
Prof. Osman Cekic	Canakkale Onsekiz Mart University, Turkey
Prof. Einar M. Skaalvik	Norwegian University of Science and Technology, Norway
Prof. Fatma Nevra Seggie	Bogazici University, Turkey
Prof. Jose Hernandez-Carrion	University of Valencia, Spain
Prof. Maria Veiga-Branco	Polytechnic Institute of Brqganco, Portugal
Prof. Joana Fernandes	Polytechnic Institute of Bragança, Portugal
Prof. Chhavi Lal	Dayalbagh Educational Institute, India
Prof. Marina De Rossi	University of Padua, Italy
Prof. Kathy Peckham-hardin	California State University, USA
Prof. Amalia Venera Todorut	Constantin Brâncuși University, Romania
Prof. Claudio Longobardi	University of Turin, Italy
Dr. Janaina Minelli De Oliveira	Rovira i Virgili University, Spain
Dr. Francisco Javier Ramos	University of Castilla-La Mancha, Spain
Dr. Rebeca Soler Costa	University of Zaragoza, Spain
Dr. Darren Pullen	University of Tasmania, Australia
Dr. Laura Clarke	Ball State University, USA
Dr. Sister Corby A Coperthwaite	Connecticut State Colleges and Universities, USA
Dr. Elena Makarova	Taganrog Institute of Management and Economics, Russia
Dr. Monika Floyd	University of Potsdam, Germany

### Manuscripts Submission

Manuscripts to be considered for publication have to be submitted by Online Manuscript Tracking System(<http://www.hrpub.org/submission.php>). If you are experiencing difficulties during the submission process, please feel free to contact the editor at [submission@hrpub.org](mailto:submission@hrpub.org).



### Contact Us

Horizon Research Publishing  
2880 ZANKER RD STE 203  
SAN JOSE, CA 95134  
USA  
Email: [editor@hrpub.org](mailto:editor@hrpub.org)

Submit your paper at [http://www.hrpub.org/journals/jour\\_submitmanuscript.php?id=95](http://www.hrpub.org/journals/jour_submitmanuscript.php?id=95)

Available Online [http://www.hrpub.org/journals/jour\\_info.php?id=95](http://www.hrpub.org/journals/jour_info.php?id=95)

**Horizon Research Publishing**

<http://www.hrpub.org>